The Development of Business Incubators in Universities in Building Business Start-Ups: Systematic Literature Review (SLR)

Adelia Rahma 1, Sudarmiatin 2
1 Student Management Science Doctoral Program, Universitas Negeri Malang
2 Lecturer Management Science Doctoral Program, Universitas Negeri Malang

*Corresponding Author(s) Email: adelia.rahma.2204139@students.um.ac.id

ABSTRACT

One place for students who want to learn about entrepreneurship through entrepreneurship learning with a business incubator. Entrepreneurship learning in tertiary institutions through business incubators is expected by the Indonesian government in building Start-Ups, especially college. The purpose of this study was to determine the effectiveness of entrepreneurship learning through business incubators in building start-ups in tertiary institutions. The method used in this research is Systematic Literature Review (SLR) by collecting and analyzing journals related to keywords. Based on the literature study conducted, it was found that the management of business incubators in tertiary institutions has been going well, this can be proven by the existence of an organizational structure, the proper management of business incubators according to their duties and responsibilities, facilities and infrastructure that are quite complete, and various different types of programs work with the same goal of growing start-up souls. The role of the business incubator in cultivating young start-ups in college is quite good. The results of this research have implications for two things. First, universities are expected to continue to upgrade entrepreneurship learning in a creative, innovative and adaptive manner. Second, the government is expected to continue to improve and equip incubator facilities evenly and improve mentoring/training programs for students.

Keywords: Business Incubator, Entrepreneurship Learning, Business Start-up.
Introduction

Challenges in developing a country by dealing with unemployment problems (Hassan et al., 2020; Lynch et al., 2021; Oo et al., 2018; Purwanto, 2019) According to data from the Central Bureau of Statistics, in 2021-2022 unemployment will experience an increase of 5.70 percent from 2018. In line with this statement Megawati et al., (2019); Winarno & Nadia, (2021) the unemployment rate which is still quite high is dominated by undergraduate graduates. Therefore, students in Indonesia are challenged to be able to create independent job opportunities, because they have the knowledge and potential to become entrepreneurs. Entrepreneurship really makes a positive contribution to the State of Indonesia in addition to minimizing unemployment in Indonesia.

One of the places for students who want to learn about entrepreneurship is through university (Gozali et al., 2020; Lutfiani et al., 2020). The Minister of Research, Technology and Higher Education (Menristekdikti) said that universities have research and make prototypes and innovations that can be applied by industry that will be useful for society. Therefore, universities are required to have a technology-based business incubator (Barugahara & Maumbe, 2018); Utami et al., 2021). Creating a business incubator within a tertiary institution including services provided for in Presidential Regulation Number 27 of 2013 concerning Entrepreneurial Incubators and Minister of Cooperatives and SMEs Regulation Number 24 of 2015 concerning Norms, Standards, Procedures and Criteria (NSPK) for Entrepreneurial Incubators.

Gozali et al., (2020) stated that one way for the government to grow and also develop start-ups is through business and technology incubator programs. The incubator is the hope of many parties to become an alternative solution to the potential unemployment problem. Start-Ups are very useful when combined with academia, business, or government or it can also be called a triple helix (Daris & Nasir, 2020). The same thing was stated in the research of Chi et al., (2021) It is known that Start-Up is a form of technology-based incubator or also known as the digital world. The State of Indonesia is included in the Start-Up euphoria where there are young entrepreneurs who create businesses that have Start-Up technology with innovation and creativity in utilizing limitless technology. Because Start-Up itself is a company that uses technology and the web or is often referred to as a technology-based and online company. Start-ups can be classified into three in Indonesia with those that have attractiveness and are quick to succeed in opening a business. However, there are things in running the Start-Up business, one
of which is the use and use of technology in Start-Ups (Barlt, n.d.; Cooper, 2019; Humanities et al., 2020; Lutfiani et al., 2020; Program et al., 2017).

Syan et al., (2021) has a statement that in order to develop new Start-Ups so that they continue to grow, therefore there are several industry stakeholders from telecommunications operators and investors who collaborate in building various incubation and acceleration activities. There is a basis in forming students to become novice entrepreneurs in forming creativity such as: (1) creativity can accept current views, (2) creativity in rejecting current views with this creativity and creativity can synthesize current views or paradigms (Pudianti, Herawati, and Purwaningsih 2018). This incubation activity can influence the digital industry in Indonesia by utilizing the innovation and creativity of new entrepreneurs in developing their business.

Apart from having to have superior business incubator facilities and infrastructure, entrepreneurship learning delivered by lecturers to students also requires innovation and learning strategies (Agarwal et al., 2020; Cho & Lee, 2018; Lynch et al., 2021). Furthermore, in the research of Gianodis & Meek, (2020); Prabhu, (2019) also argues that entrepreneurial learning design means a pattern that is used as a basic guideline in the form of global policies through stages directed at carrying out ideal interactions between managers of educational institutions, educators and students, which are planned and organized in the mechanism of education management and contains the design factors of activities to study entrepreneurship. Implementing these learners can be carried out in educational institutions both in formal and non-formal education. It can even be done in an informal educational environment.

Hernández-Sánchez et al., (2019) stated that entrepreneurship learning is the latest international study and continues to be researched and developed dynamically in all parts of the world. Entrepreneurship learning is carried out starting from universities, middle schools, elementary schools until there are playgroups of entrepreneurship for children. The development of entrepreneurship learning around the world is none other than the increasing awareness of the importance of entrepreneurial character in young people who are creative, innovative and dare to manage risks (Wardana et al., 2020).
This is clearly explained by Corrales-Estrada et al., (2021); Kamau, (2021); Suoniemi et al., (2020) that a country will prosper if entrepreneurs in a country reach 2% of the total population. Indonesia is very aware of the importance of entrepreneurship education for the advancement of Indonesia's human resources to respond to future challenges. According to Fatima & Bilal, (2020); Lyons et al., (2021); Tentama & Abdussalam, (2020); Zinko et al., (2020) the objectives of holding entrepreneurship learning are (1) building entrepreneurial character (2) preparing entrepreneurship learning services based on business practices (3) preparing industry teaching pilots at universities (4) preparing university graduates to become entrepreneurs. Tiwari & Suresha, (2021) also said that in today's world developments a government is required to have an entrepreneurial spirit. By having an entrepreneurial spirit, the bureaucracy and agencies will have innovation, optimism and compete to create new ways that are more efficient, effective, innovative, flexible and adaptive (Bazkiae et al., 2020; Sang & Lin, 2019; Yang & Kim, 2020).

Based on this explanation it can be concluded that the purpose of learning entrepreneurship is to provide students with provisions on how to become a good entrepreneur and to form a complete human being, as a human being who has the character, understanding and skills as an entrepreneur by the Indonesian government in building Start-Ups. Even though some students have succeeded in establishing a start-up, the university still needs to pay attention to other students who want to set up a start-up or develop their start-up that they have created. Therefore, the business incubator at the university plays an important role as a forum for students, both students who are just starting their start-ups and developing existing startups.

Based on the description above, novelty or research updates can be raised in entrepreneurship learning through business incubators at the tertiary level. From the background and previous research as described, the research aims to fill in the gaps of previous studies by conducting a comprehensive study of business incubators and practical entrepreneurship learning. Researchers were motivated to conduct this research because of the importance of the role of students to always provide assistance, both moral and material to economic development, especially entrepreneurship so that it continues to rotate. And students are expected to be able to collaborate with each other with the business community. This research contributes to two things: First, universities are expected to continue to upgrade entrepreneurship learning creatively, innovatively and adaptively, secondly, the government is
expected to continue to improve and equip incubator facilities evenly and improve mentoring/training programs for students.

THEORETICAL

The review of the theories described in this research comes from several relevant previous studies, as the basis for the theoretical framework, determination, and research analysis. Furthermore, in this section, successive discussions of:

Entrepreneurship Learning in Higher Education

Entrepreneurial learning means a pattern that is used as a basic guideline in the form of global policy through stages directed at carrying out ideal interactions between managers of educational institutions, educators and students, which are planned and organized in the mechanism of education management and contain factors for designing activities to study entrepreneurship (Fatimah et al., 2020; Naimah et al., 2020). Implementing these learners can be carried out in educational institutions both in formal and non-formal education. It can even be done in an informal educational environment. Mukti & Kusumo, (2021); Public et al., (2020) explain that entrepreneurship learning is the latest international study and continues to be researched and developed dynamically in all parts of the world. Entrepreneurship learning is carried out starting from universities, middle schools, elementary schools until there are playgroups of entrepreneurship for children. The development of entrepreneurship learning around the world is none other than the increasing awareness of the importance of entrepreneurial character in young people who are creative, innovative and dare to manage risks.

Ghina & Sinaryanti, (2021); Humanities et al., (2020); Lutfiani et al., (2020) stated that Higher Education is an Important Agent for Change in the Future of the Nation. The campus has an irreplaceable role in creating an entrepreneurial culture in Indonesia and at the same time as the formation and training of new entrepreneurs, for the following reasons:

1) The campus is the main terminal for the educated young generation to enter the labor market, meaning that the tertiary period is the last chance to ensure that graduates of educational institutions become financially independent citizens.
2) The campus is the best place to carry out human resource development. Everyone who comes to campus and becomes a campus citizen has a mindset for learning and has concentrated part of his life on studying and improving his quality.

3) The campus has human resources educators, experts who are committed to developing the potential of the younger generation.

In addition, Komara & Bagus Setiawan, (2020); Lutfiani et al., (2020) explains further about the role of Higher Education in the development of small and medium enterprises, namely:

1) Higher Education has laboratory facilities that can be utilized for research and development activities.

2) Higher Education has faculties from various disciplines (specializations) that can be utilized for developmental development studies from various aspects according to the case at hand.

3) Higher Education is a non-profit organization that has a strong vision in community empowerment through the Tri Darma of Higher Education.

4) Higher Education has quite a number of students who can be mobilized through certain activities such as KKN, Social Service and others to support PT activities in carrying out consulting activities.

**Business Start-up**

According to Rama Mamuaya, CEO of dailysocial.net, startups in Indonesia are classified into three groups, namely:

- Startup game creators
- Education application startup
- Trade startups such as e-commerce and information

With the development of digital technology, companies can take advantage of this convenience in making buying and selling transactions with customers using social media so that product introduction becomes faster and more practical.
RESEARCH METHODS

In this study using systematic literature (Systematic Literature Review / SLR) which discusses problems in learning entrepreneurship in universities and start-up businesses. Literature study research is a process or activity of collecting data from various literature such as books and journals to compare the results of one study with another (Nowell et al, 2014).

The purpose of this literature study research is to obtain a theoretical basis that can support solving the problem being researched and reveal various theories that are relevant to the case, more specifically in this research the researcher examines problems in entrepreneurial literacy at the tertiary level. This literature study is a comprehensive summary of several research studies that are determined based on a particular theme. The data used in this research is secondary data obtained not from direct observation, but obtained from the results of research that has been conducted by previous researchers.

The secondary data source obtained is in the form of articles from reputable journals with predetermined themes. The literature search in this literature study uses the Sagepub, Springer, Elsevier, MDPI and Emerald Insight databases. Searching for published articles on the search engines (Search Engines) above uses keywords, namely: "Entrepreneurship Learning, Business Incubator and Strat Up". The search process or search process is used to obtain relevant sources to answer the research question (RQ) and other related references using Search Engine Dimensions (https://www.emerald.com/insight/). From the identification results, it was obtained more than 1550 articles. Furthermore, articles were filtered according to access criteria, year, type of content and abstract analysis. As a result, 87 article titles were obtained. From the title of the article, then filtered based on the feasibility of the topic of digital transformation through abstract analysis, the results obtained were 6 articles. In detail, it looks like in the following image:
RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Results

The results of the study of selected articles answer the formulation of the problem regarding the distribution of journals that discuss Entrepreneurship Learning in Higher Education through Business Incubators, as follows:

Table 1. Distribution of related journals about business incubators, entrepreneurship learning

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Journal Name</th>
<th>Journal Link</th>
<th>Indexation</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Entrepreneurship theory and practice</td>
<td>Entrepreneurship theory and practice</td>
<td>Sage Publish</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Technology in Society</td>
<td>Technology in Society</td>
<td>Elsevier</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Economic Development Quarterly</td>
<td>Economic Development Quarterly</td>
<td>Sage Publish</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>The Journal of Technology Transfer</td>
<td>The Journal of Technology Transfer</td>
<td>Springer</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>International Journal of Educational Development</td>
<td>International Journal of Educational Development</td>
<td>Elsevier</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Sustainability</td>
<td>Sustainability</td>
<td>MDPI</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: processed by researchers, 2023
DISCUSSION

Systemically, the incubation business is a vehicle (Lutfiani et al., 2020). Order directives, human resources who are not or less creative and productive become human resources who have entrepreneurial motivation in a creative, innovative, productive and cooperative manner as the first step of entrepreneurial steps that have competitive and comparative advantages and have a clear vision and mission going forward. In line with this (Komara & Bagus Setiawan, 2020) argues that business incubation has a range of communities that integrate with each other in operations and activities, namely: entrepreneurs, universities, financial institutions, business consultants, business law operations (business law advisers), private sector, BUMN / BUMD, the government through related technical agencies, and non-governmental organizations.

So that all activities in the Business Incubator in Higher Education are under control, a Business Incubator management, organizational structure and duties and responsibilities are formed. There are many functions of the Business Incubator organizational structure. Descaprio (2013: 47) states that there are four functions of the Business Incubator organizational structure, namely facilitating practice and research planning, facilitating the management of research activities and practices in incubation, facilitating reporting and accountability of all activities in the business incubator so that they are easily evaluated, facilitating monitoring of all activities in the incubation.

When viewed from several researchers Amelia et al., (2021); Bagis & Nasir, (2020); Gozali et al., (2020) Business incubators can be divided into several types, namely (a) industrial incubators, government-supported incubators and non-profit institutions. The goal is to achieve unemployment; work is usually to overcome the unemployment rate. (b) University-related incubators, incubators that aim to commercialize science, technology and intellectual property rights from research results. College incubators offer startups access to college laboratory, library, and specialist services. This incubator is supported directly by universities and other interested parties. (c) A non-profit property development incubator, an incubator that provides offices, production sites and service facilities together.
Several office facilities that support the company's image are shared and incubators collect rental fees from the use of these facilities. Business incubators in universities are expected to have a non-profit property development type because they have partnerships with several tenants. In order to continue to exist, it is necessary to have a work program carried out by business incubators in tertiary institutions, such as the implementation of UKM technical guidance and consulting activities which will be provided at any time by the Business Incubator. The material provided is material related to tenant productivity in entrepreneurship. Guidance will be accompanied by professionals who have expertise and experience in the field of incubation, Application of business management, Financial management, How to apply for business credit, Application of appropriate technology to increase productivity and quality of production, Marketing strategy, Use of e-commerce, Networking, Business licenses, Ministry of Religion (halal certification), BPOM Agency (distribution permit), HKI (brand, copyright, industrial permit), Testing institute.

To develop new Start-Ups so that they continue to grow, the roles of universities through entrepreneurship learning with business incubators must be increased. Learning is believed to be able to develop various human potentials. With the learning is expected to increase the knowledge, attitudes and skills possessed. Learning is a conscious effort that aims to change a person's behavior. These learning activities need to be designed, regulated, monitored in such a way and evaluated in order to be able to achieve the stated goals.

Entrepreneurship learning through practice in business incubators is very effective and has a positive effect on students' entrepreneurial competence. This is in accordance with relevant previous research by Bagis & Nasir, 2020 which concluded that entrepreneurial learning through business incubators had a positive and significant effect on entrepreneurial competence. The effectiveness of entrepreneurship learning using the Business Incubator has been proven by the active participation of students in practice at the Business Incubator, many student activities are carried out at the Business Incubator. Students are also enthusiastic in accepting entrepreneurship learning theory. So that lecturers as teachers also find it easier to explain entrepreneurship learning through practice in Business Incubators, at least have experience in the field of entrepreneurship.
CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Conclusions

The role of the business incubator in cultivating young start-ups in college is quite good. This can be seen from the development of business incubators at universities which are quite developed every year giving rise to new businesses made by students. Based on the type of business being carried out, which was originally a conventional business exploring the years leading to a digitalized business. The management of business incubators in several tertiary institutions is going well, this can be proven by the existence of an organizational structure, the running management of business incubators according to their duties and responsibilities, facilities and infrastructure that are quite complete, and various different types of work programs with the same goal of growing the spirit -soul start-up.

Recommendations

Based on the above conclusions, researchers can provide suggestions that will help develop Business Incubators in Higher Education, namely the development of higher education business incubator models still needs to be improved. For Business Incubators in Higher Education, they can take part in the programs provided, facilitating technology-based Start-Ups. facilitating the legality of the business of tenants and lecturers who teach entrepreneurship courses are lecturers who have an entrepreneurial background so that the entrepreneurship learning process will run optimally. In addition, Incubator Managers or heads of each institution can conduct comparative studies at universities in Indonesia or even abroad to get the latest references regarding the management of Business Incubators so that Higher Education Business Incubators can follow Business Incubator standards as well as International ones. In addition, it is necessary to collaborate between universities that have an Entrepreneurship Development Program so that they can establish cooperation in the form of joint activities.
REFERENCE


