A Proposed Conceptual Model of Teacher Turnover Intention in the Vocational High Schools in Indonesia

Jajat Sudrajat¹, Siow Heng Loke², Syafwandi³, Efri Syamsul Bahri⁴, Ibar Adi Permana⁵

¹TMKM Polytechnic, Indonesia email: jajat@tmkm.ac.id
²Asia e University, Malaysia. email: hengloke.siow@aeu.edu.my
³STIA Menarasiswa Bogor, Indonesia. email: syafwand@menarasiswa.ac.id
⁴SEBI School of Islamic Economics, Indonesia. email: efri.sb@sebi.ac.id
⁵TMKM Polytechnic, Indonesia. email: ibar@tmkm.ac.id
*Corresponding Author(s) Email: jajat@tmkm.ac.id

ABSTRACT
The description of the determinants of teacher turnover intention in Vocational High School (SMK) is still not optimally depicted in Indonesia. This condition is due to the limited number of special studies that focus on teacher turnover intentions for vocational school teachers. At the same time, the role of vocational school teachers is essential for the sustainability of educational institutions. Therefore, this study aims to build a conceptual model that determines teacher turnover intention. Literature research data was collected between 2006 and 2021, sourced from Google Scholar. In addition, the preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses (PRISMA) and bibliometric approaches were used for data analysis. The findings of the study lead to the development of a conceptual model to determine teacher turnover intention, which includes five variables: job satisfaction, interpersonal stress, efficacy, prosocial motivation, and organizational culture. It was found that teacher turnover intention can be measured through three dimensions: the possibility of individuals leaving the organization, teachers' cognitions and attitudes, and the frequency and intensity of intentions.

Keywords: turnover intention, teacher, vocational high school, education, Indonesia
Introduction

Teachers have important roles, among others: as teachers and a vehicle for transferring value systems (Kirom 2017), educators (Alam and Syamsuriati 2020), motivators (Manizar 2017). These teachers are specialised to teach at various school levels, including elementary schools, junior high schools, and high schools (Hadi 2019). In Indonesia, the high school consists of senior high school (SMA), vocational high school (SMK), and Madrasah Aliyah (MA). One of the teacher placements that gets attention is the teacher who teaches at the Vocational High School.

SMK was established to produce students ready to work to overcome unemployment (Usman and Raharjo 2012). For this reason, SMK has a different curriculum from SMA and MA. The curriculum used is the 2013 Curriculum which refers to the Law on the National Education System (Suyatmini 2017). With the uniqueness of SMK, it is necessary to have competent teachers (Rochmawati, Timan, and Kusumaningrum 2019). Competent teachers are an investment in the sustainability of SMK. One of the factors to sustain competent teachers is to reduce the level of teacher turnover. The lower the teacher turnover, the better the SMK. Therefore, the problem of teacher turnover needs to be addressed by all parties.

Turnover is related to a condition in which a person decides to leave an organization, and to be replaced by someone else (Purba, Putri, and Imelda 2020). Then, the turnover intention is defined as the desire to look for alternative job opportunities in other better organizations (Roni, 2016). Suryani, Kuncoro, and Nurjanah (2014) explain that the turnover rate consists of three categories: 10% (very high), 5%-10% (high), and less than 5% (low). A high turnover rate will impact the sustainability of an organization (Purba et al. 2020) and threaten students' academic achievement (Jensen 2021).

Teacher turnover intention has been seen as a strong predictor and alternative measure of actual turnover behaviour (Cho and Lewis 2012; Qin 2019). Teachers who have a high quality of work-life will have a low turnover intention (Izzati and Mulyana 2020). One of the factors that triggers teacher turnover is unfulfilled expectations which eventually resign (Rosalina, Matin, and Kamaludin 2018). Therefore, the discussion on teacher turnover intention needs the special attention of various parties.

However, the scenario of teacher turnover intention in SMK is still not optimally depicted in Indonesia. This situation is caused by the lack of a comprehensive picture related to teacher turnover intention. As an illustration, the turnover phenomenon every year is around 10 to 12% in employees (Suryani et al., 2014). The results of a study by Qin (2021) of teachers and schools from 32 OECD countries found that teacher turnover intentions vary widely between countries and between schools in that country concerned. Indonesia also witnesses this degree of variations as experienced by other countries and among the schools in Indonesia.

This show that the quality of education in Vocational High Schools has not been optimal as expected by the government and society (Siahaan and Meilani 2019). Warsito et al. (2021) identified that the poor quality of an organization's program could result in high employee turnover. The government and society need to initiate a programme that could prepare teachers to face various challenges in this century. Henceforth, it is the purpose of this research is to identify and develop a conceptual model of the determinants of teachers' turnover intentions.
Various analyzes regarding teacher turnover intention have been carried out. However, the analysis is still limited, for example, discussing the relationship between quality of work-life and turnover intention (Izzati and Mulyana 2020), the effect of job satisfaction and organizational commitment on teacher turnover (Purba et al. 2020), open and distance learning program innovation (Zaman et al. 2021). Meanwhile, research related to teacher turnover intention in SMK is still limited to two variables and is not comprehensive (Suryani et al., 2014). In line with this information, research on teacher turnover intention needs to be initiated because it can provide information about the factors that influence teacher turnover intention in SMK. In addition, the findings obtained can be used as the basis for research on the development of vocational teachers in Indonesia. The results can also be used by the government that wants to develop SMK in Indonesia successfully. Therefore, this study aims to identify the determinants of teacher turnover intention and develop a conceptual model.

Methodology
The research design used a qualitative method with a systematic literature review approach. This research design is used to identify the determinants of Teacher Turnover Intention. The data source comes from reference journals in the Google Scholars database. Data collection techniques using reference applications. Articles selection was carried out using the PRISMA-P (Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses Protocols) approach.

Based on the PRISMA-P approach, the data selection process is carried out in four stages: identification, screening, eligibility, and included, as presented in Figure 1. At the identification stage, the process of identifying and searching articles on the database uses two keywords: "teacher turnover intention" and "determination". At the screening stage, articles were selected in the database by excluding articles that have similarities. Finally, in the eligibility stage, potential articles were selected based on title and abstract screening. At this stage, an exception was also made using three criteria: not a journal article, not available full text, and irrelevant exposure (Shahab, Rizkianti, and Herardi 2021).

The data selected based on the results of PRISMA-P was then analyzed using a bibliometric approach. Bibliometric analysis using the VOSviewer application. Bibliometric analysis was used to see research development, active authors, and terms that often appear.
In this study, the descriptive analysis began with an explanation of teacher turnover intention. Then, the discussion continued with the determinants of teacher turnover intention and identifying indicators of teacher turnover intention. In sum, a conceptual model of the determinants of teacher turnover intention would be proposed.

**Findings**

**Teacher Turnover Intention**

According to Adejoh et al. (2020), the turnover intention is the attitude of teachers who plan to quit the teaching profession or move from one school to another. Meanwhile, teacher turnover intention occurs when it is not handled positively (Adejoh et al. 2020). Okubanjo (2010) in Adejoh et al. (2020) identified the occurrence of teacher turnover intention, including a challenging and unpleasant work environment, aligning with career goals, and seeking more financial benefits.

Henkins and Holliman, 2009 in Adejoh et al. (2020), Ekabu, M.Kalai, and Nyagah (2018) explain that teacher turnover intention is caused by six factors in uncomfortable working conditions, namely: low remuneration, class size that is too large, inadequate administrative support, not involving them in school, management decisions, and inadequate school facilities. Meanwhile, Emoja (2016) identified four causes of teacher turnover intention: the absence of teaching materials, adequate classrooms, school furniture, and the absence of sports facilities.

**Articles about Teacher Turnover Intention**

This study has selected various articles using two keywords: "teacher turnover intention" and "determinant". Henceforth, the results of the selection process using the PRISMA-P approach are presented in Figure 2.
At the identification stage, 49 articles were found. Furthermore, at the screening stage, nine articles had the same title. At the eligibility stage, 32 articles were excluded based on the criteria: not a journal article, not available in full text, and irrelevant exposure. Thus, at the included stage, there are eight articles. Based on these selection criteria, only eight articles were selected, and the results are presented in Table 1.

Table 1
List of Articles Teacher Turnover Intention

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Journal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Qin (2021)</td>
<td>Country effects on teacher turnover intention: a multilevel, cross-national analysis</td>
<td>Educational Research for Policy and Practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Jensen (2021)</td>
<td>Pupil-teacher ratio, disciplinary problems, classroom emotional climate, and turnover intention: Evidence from a randomized control trial</td>
<td>Leadership and Policy in Schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Kusuma &amp; Syah (2020)</td>
<td>The Effect of Job Satisfaction and Organizational Commitment on Teacher Turnover Intention in X Institution in Palembang</td>
<td>Dinasti International Journal of Management Science</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Determinants of Teacher Turnover Intention

Based on data analysis of articles in reference journals, five determinants of teacher turnover intention have been identified. Table 3 presents the determinants of teacher turnover intention in detail.

Table 2
Determinants of Teacher Turnover Intention

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Factors</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Job satisfaction</td>
<td>Adejoh et al. (2020), Emoja (2016), Kusuma &amp; Syah (2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Interpersonal stress</td>
<td>Lee (2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Efficacy</td>
<td>Lee (2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Prosocial motivation</td>
<td>Yada et al. (2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Organizational culture</td>
<td>Song et al. (2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. commitment</td>
<td>Organizational commitment Kusuma &amp; Syah (2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. climate</td>
<td>Organizational climate Adejoh et al. (2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. conditions</td>
<td>Working Qin (2021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. problems</td>
<td>Discipline Jensen (2021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Collaboration</td>
<td>Collaboration Yada et al. (2020)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: PRISMA analysis results, from various references
Based on Table 3, five teacher turnover intention determinants have been identified: job satisfaction, interpersonal stress, self-efficacy, prosocial motivation, and organizational culture. Job satisfaction is related to a persistent feeling between what is expected and what is experienced and available (Adejoh et al., 2020). According to Spector's (1997) work in Adejoh et al. (2020), job satisfaction reflects people's attitudes and feelings related to work, caused by various factors, including salary, promotion, incentives, job allocation, leadership style, and administration. The study conducted by Adejoh et al. (2020) and Kusuma & Syah (2020) found that job satisfaction negatively influences teacher turnover intention.

The interpersonal stress factor is related to negative experiences caused by various conflicts and misunderstandings that occur when a member interacts with other members in performing tasks (Lee, 2020). A study conducted by Lee (2020) found that interpersonal stress had a positive and significant effect on turnover intention.

According to Lee (2012) in Lee (2020), the teacher efficacy factor is related to the teacher's belief in influencing behaviour and ability in teaching. Lopez (2018) in Lee (2020) found that teachers who have high efficacy have low turnover intentions. It is in line with the study conducted by Lee (2020), which showed that teacher efficacy had a negative and significant effect on turnover intention.

According to Nelson and Norton (2005) in Grant (2007), prosocial identity is a component of self-concept related to efforts to help and contribute, positively oriented to influence others voluntarily. Batson (1987) and Grant (2007) in Yada et al. (2020) define prosocial motivation as an allocentric psychological state or desire to provide benefits to others. Hu and Liden (2015) identified four forms of prosocial motivation: thoughts, feelings, preferences, and well-being (Yada et al., 2020). The results by Yada et al.'s (2020) study found that high prosocial motivation can predict a decrease in the desire for turnover.

Factors of organizational culture (Song et al. 2011), a study conducted by Song et al. (2011) found that organizational culture has a significant influence in reducing turnover intention. Some researchers use other terms that are in line with organizational culture, including organizational commitment (Purba et al. 2020), organizational climate (Adejoh et al. 2020), working conditions (Qin 2021), discipline problems (Jensen 2021), and collaboration (Yada et al. 2020).

**Teacher Turnover Intention Indicator**

Teacher turnover intention is related to a condition where a person desires to find alternative job opportunities in other better organizations. Teacher turnover intention can be seen based on indicators. Based on the results of an analysis of the reference literature using the PRISMA approach, three indicators of teacher turnover intention were found. Table 3 presents three indicators of teacher turnover intention in detail.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>The probability that the individual will leave the organization shortly</td>
<td>Izzati and Mulyana (2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Teacher's cognition and attitude</td>
<td>Bentein et al. (2005) in (Jensen 2021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>I often think about quitting this organization.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>I intend to look for a position in another company in the next year.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 3 | Frequency and intensity of intent | Baillard & Semmer (1994),  
(Staufenbiel and König 2010), Mobley (1982) in Nyamubarwa (2013),  
Emoja (2016) in Nyamubarwa (2013), Mobley (Horner, and Hollingsworth (1978),  
Song et al. (2011) |
| a. | I thought a lot about leaving the organization. | |
| b. | I am actively looking for alternatives to the organization. | |
| c. | As soon as possible, I will leave the organization. | |

Source: PRISMA analysis results, from various references

Based on Table 3, three dimensions of teacher turnover intention indicators have been identified: the possibility of individuals leaving the organization, teachers' cognitions and attitudes, and the frequency and intensity of intentions.

Taking cognizance on the identification of variables, the teacher turnover intention conceptual model is proposed as shown in Figure 3.

**Figure 3.** Teacher Turnover Intention Conceptual Model  
Source: data analysis with PRISMA flow diagram procedure
Based on Figure 3, the conceptual model of teacher turnover intention consists of five exogenous variables: job satisfaction, interpersonal stress, efficacy, prosocial motivation, and organizational culture. Meanwhile, the endogenous variable is teacher turnover intention. This conceptual model then needs to be tested with respondents from SMK teachers.

Conclusion
The description of the determinants of teacher turnover intention in Vocational High School (SMK) teachers is still not optimally depicted in Indonesia. This condition is due to the limited number of dedicated studies that focus on teacher turnover intentions for vocational school teachers. At the same time, the role of vocational school teachers is essential for the sustainability of SMK educational institutions. Teacher turnover intention is related to a condition where a person desires to find alternative job opportunities in other better organizations. Furthermore, they decided to leave an organization that was later replaced by someone else.

This study has identified five factors that determine teacher turnover intention, namely: five variables: job satisfaction, interpersonal stress, self-efficacy, prosocial motivation, and organizational culture. This study also found three dimensions as indicators of teacher turnover intention, including relating to the possibility of individuals leaving the organization, teacher cognition and attitudes, and the frequency and intensity of intentions. In summary, this research has also proposed a conceptual model for determining teacher turnover intention.

Various parties related to the development of vocational schools can respond to the results of this study by paying attention to the five determinants of teacher turnover intention: job satisfaction, interpersonal stress, efficacy, prosocial motivation, and organizational culture. These five factors need to be taken into considerations by the principals and policy makers of SMK to ensure the sustainability of SMKs and in serving its role in producing human resources ready to work and overcome unemployment problems.

Suggestions
The Indonesian government and stakeholders need to take heed of these findings in an attempt to reduce SMK teacher turnover intention. In doing so, this research has proposed for the stakeholders to respond to five factors that have influenced SMK teacher turnover which include: job satisfaction, interpersonal stress, efficacy, prosocial motivation, and organizational culture.

References


Rony, Zahara Tussoleha. 2016. “Siapa Harus Pergi, Siapa Harus Tinggal (Strategi Mencegah Turnover Karyawan Gen-Y).”


